


www.carl-research.org



## Researching Effects of Stakeholder Involvement on Decision-Making in Radioactive Waste Management **Conclusions from the CARL project (2004-2007)**

Anne Bergmans - former project leader - UA  
Uppsala – 17/03/2009

CARL

2

www.carl-research.org

## Content

---

- A brief introduction
- The different stages in the project
- Reports
  - Reporting during the project
  - Final report

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Uppsala - 17-18/03/2009

CARL

www.carl-research.org

**CARL**

# A Brief Introduction

4

www.carl-research.org

**CARL**

## The CARL Consortium

|          | C   | A  | R                                  | L                                   |
|----------|---|--|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Belgium  | Mun. Dessel, <b>STORA</b> ,<br>Mun. Mol, <b>MONA</b> ,<br>[PaLoFF]    | <b><u>NIRAS/</u></b><br><b><u>ONDRAF</u></b> | University of<br>Antwerp           | <b>FANC</b>                         |
| Slovenia | Municipality of Krško   | <b><u>ARAO</u></b>                           | <b>University of<br/>Ljubljana</b> | SI Nuclear<br>Safety Admin          |
| Sweden   | Mun. <b><u>Oskarshamn</u></b><br>and Östhammar                        | <b>SKB</b>                                   | Göteborg<br>University             | SKI, SSI                            |
| UK       | Local communities<br>affected by nuclear<br>facilities, <b>NuLeAF</b> | <b><u>NDA</u></b>                            | University of East<br>Anglia       | Environment<br>Agency, SEPA,<br>NII |

Legend: **steering group members**; **country coordinators**; **sponsors**

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Purpose of the Project

---

- Platform for interaction and collaboration
- Exchange of experiences and ideas
- Develop insights into SI in RWM and the outcome of such processes
  - Influence of contextual factors
  - Integration of participatory initiatives and technical programmes
- Integrating research and networking activities

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Project Phases

## 2004 -2005

---

- October 2004: start of the project
- February 2005: first small-scale workshop
  - discussion of research intentions
- **2005: country analyses**
- Fall 2005: first drafts country reports
- November 2005: workshop in Antwerp
  - presentation of country reports and discussion on four topics: nuclear communities, localisation of decisions, stakeholder competence, institutions and engagement

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## 2006

---

- February – March 2006: final versions country reports and summaries
- **2006 – 2007: thematic analyses**
- April 2006: first comparative report
- April 2006: topics for further research and research protocol
- November 2006: workshop in Troon
  - presentation of first comparative report and country up dates
  - thematic discussion sessions (research and networking)

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## 2007

---

- Summer 2007: first drafts thematic reports
- September 2007: final seminar in Oskarshamn
  - presentation of project history and thematic reports
  - group discussions on lessons learnt (networking and dissemination)
- January 2008: final versions thematic reports
- March 2008: final report

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Reports

## Country Reports

---

- Analyses of processes of SI in all countries
- Focus on:
  - particularity of national context
  - dynamics of frames used to look at the question of RWM
- 2005

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## First Comparative Report

---

- Basic typology of stakeholders and stakeholder groups on national and international level
- National and international contextual factors influencing RWM policy
- Framing and reframing of the RWM issue: impact of crises
- 2006

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Six Thematic Reports

---

- The framing of RW risk
- From government to governance?
- Stakeholder networks
- Decision domains for SI in RWM
- Reconciling technical and social aspects
- Limits to stakeholder involvement
- 2007

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Final Report

---

### **“Wanting the Unwanted”**

- Frame:  
Long term RWM = ‘wicked’ or ‘messy’  
problem (complex; unstructured; difficult to  
define; depending on political judgement for  
closure)
- Key Findings Thematic Research Lines
- General Conclusions
- 2008

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Multiple Framings of RWM

- Believers and non-believers in the manageability of the waste problem
  - culture of confrontation in the public debate
  - luxury of principled discussion
- More nuanced and pragmatic framing in nuclear communities
  - pragmatic acceptance or rather pragmatic tolerance ('putting up with')
    - social psychological factors
    - structural factors

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Changes in governing RWM (1/2)

- Participation: a sign of the times
  - top down pressure: Aarhus convention, EU regulations, ...
  - bottom up pressure: growing citizen expectations
- Participation in RWM:
  - seems to go further than in most other sectors;
  - in many respects unique and innovative
    - Sweden, Belgium and Slovenia: focus on local acceptability of more or less pre-defined waste facilities
    - The UK: initiation of an options appraisal process, setting a European precedent for national-level SE
  - But: no full power sharing or co-governance

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009



## Changes in governing RWM (2/2)

- Burden remains on affected communities themselves to assure adequate level of engagement
  - Importance of actively seeking alliance with others in the same situation
- But: RWM agencies have also to gain from good relationship with potential hosts
- Closest thing to co-decision making to be found in siting processes at the local, operational level (as long as no 'national intervention' is needed)
- Strategic decision making remains at best consultative

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Social and Technical Aspects (1/2)

- Almost universal recognition of importance of social aspects of RWM
- But: no thorough integration yet of the socio-political and the techno-scientific
  - Decisions on technical aspects remain largely prerogative of the techno-scientific community
  - SI often focussed on the **social aspects**
    - In practice this is often even further reduced to the socio-economic
    - But: it is also about securing a sustainable relationship with the waste and the waste management system; about feeling safe; about trust in technical options; about what constitutes legitimate knowledge; ...

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Social and Technical Aspects

(2/2)

- Technical-social divide: largely artificial
  - definition of what is waste
  - choice for deep disposal of HLW
- Recognition of existence and importance of social aspects in RWM and participatory turn has already led to impressive results (cf. Sweden and Belgium)
  - need to safeguard what has been gained so far
  - look for ways to deepen even further interaction between experts and affected citizens
  - look for ways to continue ensuring convergence between technical requirements and neighbours expectations on design, accessibility, monitoring, and so forth of the repository site

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009

## Final Conclusions

- We are witnessing a process that may still not have reached full maturity
- Biggest challenges for the future:
  - opening up the technical 'black box' to the mutual benefit of both experts and society
  - working towards a closer integration of the technical and the social ⇒ to arrive at creative and sustainable solutions to a problem that is technically, socially, politically and economically complex

ARGONA End-Users Conference - Upsala - 17-18/03/2009